SC P2P Learning Programme

EXPERT REVIEWS
(Cities)

Terms of Reference

Table of Contents

Expert Reviews (Cities)

1. Purpose and background

What is SCALABLE CITIES?

Scalable Cities represents **120 cities** who are involved in **18 Smart Cities and Communities projects** funded by Horizon 2020 with around EUR 345 million. Working in consortia with academia, industry, associations and consultants, they implement more than 550 demonstrations of technological and social innovations in the areas **of mobility and logistics, buildings, urban data and ICT infrastructure, citizen engagement as well as urban governance.**

What is peer-to peer learning?

The Scalable Cities Peer-to-Peer (P2P) Learning programme is part of the activities organised by the Scalable Cities Secretariat to support capacity building and knowledge sharing.

The overall objectives of the P2P Learning programme are to enable cities to share their **knowledge, experiences and provide expert support to overcome barriers and challenges** related to the implementation of smart city solutions. Participants can take the newly gained information back to their cities and try to adapt or develop their smart solutions and concepts in reaching the European climate goals and targets.

All the activities designed in the P2P Learning programme aim to:

- *Support the replication and scaling up of solutions and results from EU-funded Smart Cities and Communities (SCC) projects[1]*
- *Mentor cities to build capacity*
- *Accelerate the interchange of lessons learnt between cities and experts*
- *Identify and promote future collaborations for projects and joint initiatives between cities and their partners*

Peer-to-peer support and mentoring will ensure that the lessons learnt in one city can help other cities solve their problems and lead to a more efficient way of working. The programme also aims at helping cities adapt and scale solutions by facilitating expert advice on key topics and overcome challenges.

The Scalable Cities P2P learning provides tailor-made support for Lighthouse cities and Fellow Cities through three capacity learning and exchange activities:

---

[1] Remourban, Triangulum, Growsmarter, SmartEnCity, Replicate, Smarter Together, SharingCities, Ruggedised, MySmartLife, MatchUp, Stardust, IRIS, +CityChange, Making-City, SPARCS, POCITYF, ATELIER, RESPONSE.

Scalable Cities Peer-to-Peer Learning facilitates the following activities:

- Knowledge exchange ideas on how to address key urban challenges

- Showcase the city projects and progress, and share lessons learnt with other cities

- Receiving peer advice from other cities with experience in a specific domain

- Receive individual, technical expert advice on how to overcome barriers and challenges on concrete initiatives, strategies or projects.

- Cities giving other cities feedback and advice on their strategy

2. What is an Expert Review?

Expert Reviews support cities in the preparation of key strategic documents for their innovation initiatives. Cities that are drafting documents, strategies, roadmaps or project designs can use the insights of an external experts' advice on the document. The expert will do a remote review of the document and will share his or her opinions about the approach, key shortcomings and improvement opportunities.

The main goal of the Expert Review service is to make available to cities the easy access to ad hoc expert advice on a given topic and for a very concrete document or strategy.

3. Methodology

Expert reviews follow a very simple process. Cities that are in the process of developing strategies, roadmaps, procurement plans, technical documentation, funding proposals, etc. and that would like to receive some expert insights for this concrete activity, can request expert reviews at any moment in the year, once the call is open and until extinguishing the funding allocated to this service.

The Scalable Cities Secretariat will evaluate all requests received from cities every several weeks at defined cut-off dates and select the cities that can be supported. Once selected cities receive the notification about the approval of their request. They will be asked to provide more detailed information about the stage of development of the document that is to be reviewed and confirmation of the expert profile sought. Scalable Cities Secretariat will then proceed to select and contract an expert who will conduct the review.

Once the expert is selected and hired by the Scalable Cities Secretariat, a preparation meeting will be held between the expert, the contact person in the city, and the Scalable Cities Secretariat, to discuss the timeline and expectations concerning the review, as well as to provide background to

the request. The document to be reviewed and any relevant complementary documentation or background information that might have been identified during the preparation meeting will then be shared by the city with the expert via the Scalable Cities (SC) Secretariat.

The expert will assess the documentation for a period of maximum **three days,** and will prepare a report about the key findings, recommendations and additional resources that can support the improvement of the city's document. The key findings of this report will be discuss with the city during a final meeting.

Further information can be found in the guidelines of the Peer-to-Peer Learning at the Scalable Cities Secretariat website[2].

4. Deliverables

The main deliverable of the Expert Review is the report prepared by the Expert, which will include the review of the document, including key findings, recommendations and additional resources that can support the improvement of the city's document.

The beneficiary city will be required to provide:

- Testimonial: Quote from representative of the city capturing the impressions and experiences as a beneficiary of the service, to be published in different SC Secretariat website, publications or on-line media.

- Evaluation report: A template will be provided from the SC Secretariat to the beneficiary city to provide feedback about the expert and the service.

5. Eligible cities

Lighthouse and Fellow cities participating in ongoing or closed Smart Cities and Communities (SCC) projects are eligible to use this service. However, priority will be given to Fellow Cities and to small and mid-sized cities (50,000 – 500,000 inhabitants).

The request can be submitted by a representative of a local authority, departments, public utility, public agency, managing or coordinating authority, or any other public body linked to the city.

6. Selection criteria

- Lighthouse and Fellow Cities that have participated in a closed or ongoing SCC project (see Annex I). Priority will be given to small and mid-sized cities (50,000 – 500,000 inhabitants).

- Degree of development of the document by the time of the expected review. Alignment of the timeline to the objectives of the activity.

- Relevance of the document to review for the development of innovative solutions and/or green initiatives in the city.

- Strategic value of the document. Importance of its success for the city.

- The solution or initiative developed in the document has a clear institutional, socio-economic or environmental impact for the city.

7. Key topics and supported activities

The activity follows a demand-driven approach, and documents to be reviewed can cover any sectoral topic, as long as it is linked to the development of innovative solutions for smart cities.

Cities can request expert reviews for any strategy document that will/are planned, drafted or in process of implementation. The aim is to get documents reviewed at an early stage on smart city relevant areas such as: Smart city strategies, funding strategies, investment plans, procurement documents, technical strategies and plans (mobility, energy, ICT and digital transformation, citizen engagement), etc.

The types of documents that are to be reviewed are up to the city, depending on its needs and current state of implementation: master plans, strategies, terms of reference, methodologies, funding proposals, engagement plans, monitoring sand evaluation approaches, etc.

The Secretariat will seek to engage experts with the knowledge to review and provide guidance on the topics addressed. Experts can be expected to review the document, suggest improvements to the approach and suggest ways forward and best practices for inspiration. Some examples of possible assignments are:

- Alignment of local strategies with European strategies and concepts:

    - *The city is in the process of developing a Sustainable Urban Mobility Plan and would need external expertise to assess whether the current structure and approach is aligned with European guidelines, if it is similar to what other cities have done, and if there are funding opportunities for some of the actions included in the document. The expert can review the document and highlight which elements are missing or need reinforcing, point at best practices and good examples to follow, and identify some policy and funding instruments that could support the implementation of the plan in the future.*

- Guidance on preparation of investment plans and concepts for upscaling projects to receive funding and financing[3]:

    - *The city wants to prepare an investment plan for future infrastructures on the domain of energy, has identified strategic projects to promote in the following years and is exploring different financing options. The expert can support in assessing the overall strategy, steer in the direction of funding opportunities and additional support mechanisms to finalise and implement the plan.*

---

[3] The activities supported in the P2P Learning programme can be seen as a pre-step for other Scalable Cities tools such as the Roadshow and Action Grant. More information on the Action Grant can be accessed through this link.

- *The city is preparing a funding proposal to attract European or private funding for a specific project and needs an expert review to assess the quality of the concept, the scope and structure of the proposal. The expert can support in reviewing the overall project and document, identify weaknesses and improvement opportunities and provide insights on the specific funding mechanism that can help improve the overall proposal*.

- Regulatory and governance support:

  - *During the implementation of its Digital Transformation Strategy, the city is testing the use of Artificial Intelligence applications to improve some services to their citizens, but the officers feel unsure about current recommendations about data privacy and protection in some of the use cases they are testing. The expert can review the protocol created to address this issue and some technical documentation from the pilots and help officers identify what is missing, reference documents to refer to, and suggest valuable contact points or resources for further support.*

  - *The city is preparing Public Procurement of Innovation process to acquire some goods or services. Despite having checked other practices and some initial experiences, officials need an expert on the matter that can review the procurement materials and identify possible risks and improvements. The expert can review the procurement documents or project roadmap and make suggestions to limit risks, increase clarity of improve the overall process*.

Cities need to consider that experts will have up to three days to review the documentation and generate a report, with an additional day for meetings and preparation. In case of excessively lengthy documentation or assignments beyond the scope of the review, the Secretariat will discuss with the city different options to adapt the assignment.

8. Application procedure

Interested cities are invited to submit their request by filling-in the **Expert Review – City Form** provided in this link.

The completed request form and the relevant documents have to be submitted via the **application platform**.

In case of questions, cities can send their requests to: **Scalablecities@ait.ac.at** clearly stating on the Subject of their e-mail: "**Expert Review".**

9. Evaluation

The evaluation and final selection of cities and experts will be performed by the SC Secretariat with approval of CINEA, following the selection criteria presented in *Section 3. Eligibility and Selection criteria*.

10. Timeline and deadlines

The call for cities to request SC Secretariat support for an expert review will launch on **1st of September 2022**. *The call will remain open for the period 2021–2025 or until the call's budget has been exhausted.*

Throughout the year there will be several cut-off dates, when the SC Secretariat will review the applications received, select beneficiary cities and proceed to source and contract the experts for the cities. The concrete date of each cut-off will be announced after the one immediately before.

Date for the first cut-off and tentative dates for the following ones are defined in the graphic below.

Cut-off 1:	**Cut-off 2**	**Cut-off 3**	*Cut-off 4***
11 October 2022	December 2022*	March 2023*	*May 2023*

*Dates are tentative. Concrete dates for each cut-off will be announced on the Scalable Cities website.
**Subject to availability of funds

The reviews selected during each cut-off will have to be implemented in the months following the award. *The following timeframes are scheduled for the implementation of the expert reviews awarded upon each cut-off.*

> **Cut-off 1:** *October – December 2023*
> **Cut-off 2:** *February - April 2023*
> **Cut-off 3:** *April – June 2023*
> **Cut-off 4:** *June – September 2023*

The concrete date will be coordinated amongst the cities, experts and the secretariat upon selection of cities and experts.

11. Funding

Expert reviews are a service that SC Secretariat offers to cities. The SC Secretariat entirely covers the cost of matching selected cities with experts with the required technical knowledge for the review, the hiring of these experts and the overseeing of the process.

12. Data policy & privacy statement

Processing of personal data

To manage the application process of the call the recording and processing of personal data (such as name, address and CV) are necessary. Such data will be processed according to Regulation (EU) 2018/1725 on the protection of natural persons with regard to the processing of personal data by the Union institutions, bodies, offices and agencies and the free movement of such data. Unless indicated otherwise, the questions and any personal data requested that are required to evaluate the application in accordance with the call for proposal will be processed solely for that purpose.

ANNEX I. List of Lighthouse and Follow Cities of Scalable Cities

Closed projects *(as of May 2022)*

Lighthouse projects of Scalable Cities	Lighthouse Cities	Follower Cities
Remourban	Valladolid (ES)	Seraing (BE)
	Nottingham (UK)	Miskolc (HU)
	Tepebasi (TR)	
Triangulum	Manchester (UK)	Leipzig (DE)
	Eindhoven (NL)	Praha (CZ)
	Stavanger (NO)	Sabadell (ES)
Growsmarter	Stockholm (SE)	Cork (IE)
	Cologne (DE)	Graz (AT)
	Barcelona (ES)	Porto (PT)
		Suceava (RO)
		Valletta (MT)
SmartEnCity	Sønderborg (DK)	Asenovgrad (BG)
	Vitoria Gasteiz (ES)	Lecce (IT)
	Tartu (EE)	
Replicate	Donostia-San Sebastián (ES)	Essen (DE)
	Florence (IT)	Lausanne (CH)
	Bristol (UK)	Nilüfer (TR)
Smarter Together	Lyon (FR)	Venezia (IT)
	Munich (DE)	Sofia (BG)
	Vienna (AT)	Santiago de Compostela (ES)
SharingCities	London (UK)	Bordeaux (FR)
	Milan (IT)	Bourgas (BG)
	Lisbon (PT)	Warsaw (PL)
Ruggedised	Glasgow (UK)	Brno (CZ)
	Umea (SE)	Gdansk (PL)
	Rotterdam (NL)	Parma (IT)
MySmartLife	Helsinki (FL)	Bydgoszcz (PL)
	Hamburg (DE)	Palencia (ES)
	Nantes (FR)	Rijeka (HR)
MatchUp	Valencia (ES)	Herzliya (ISR)
	Dresden (DE)	Kerava (FL)
	Antalya (TR)	Ostend (BE)
		Skopje (MKD)
Stardust	Tampere (FL)	Cluj-Napoca (RO)

	Pamplona (ES)	Derry (UK)
	Trento (IT)	Kozani (GR)
		Litoměřice (CZ)
IRIS	Gothenborg (SE)	Alexandroupolis (GR)
	Utrecht (NL)	Focşani (RO)
	Nice (FR)	Santa Cruz de Tenerife (ES)
		Vaasa (FL)
+CityxChange	Trondheim (NO)	Alba Iulia (RO)
	Limerick (IE)	Pisek (CZ)
		Sestao (ES)
		Smolyan (BG)
		Võru (EE)
MAKING-CITY	Oulu (FL)	Bassano del Gappa (IT)
	Groningen (NL)	León (ES)
		Kadiköy (TR)
		Trencin (SK)
		Vidin (BG)
		Lublin (PL)
SPARCS	Espoo (FL)	Lviv (UKR)
	Leipzig (DE)	Maia (PT)
		Kifissia (GR)
		Kladno (CZ)
POCITYF	Alkmaar (NL)	Bari (IT)
	Évora (PT)	Celje (SL)
		Granada (ES)
		Hvidovre (DK)
		Ioannina (GR)
		Ujpest (HU)
Atelier	Amsterdam (NL)	Bratislava (SK)
	Bilbao (ES)	Budapest (HU)
		Copenhagen (DK)
		Krakow (PL)
		Matosinhos (PT)
		Riga (LV)
RESPONSE	Dijon (FR)	Brussels (BE)
	Turku (FL)	Zaragoza (ES)

Abbreviations	
AT – Austria	IE – Ireland
BE – Belgium	ISR – Israel
BG – Bulgaria	IT – Italy
CY – Cyprus	LT – Lithuania
CZ – Czechia	LU – Luxembourg
DE - Germany	LV - Latvia
DK – Denmark	MT – Malta

EE – Estonia	NL – Netherlands
ES – Spain	PO – Poland
FI – Finland	PT – Portugal
FR – France	RO – Romania
GR – Greece	SE – Sweden
HR – Croatia	SI - Slovenia
HU – Hungary	SK – Slovakia